

Reducing the Gender Gap/ Engendering PRSP 2

by

Khawar Mumtaz

This Study should not be reported as representing the views of the Ministry of Finance.

This Study was commissioned under the “Support to PRSP-II Formulation Project”, as part of the consultative process for preparing PRSP-II. The views expressed in this Study are those of the author and do not necessarily represent those of the Ministry of Finance.

Reducing the Gender Gap/ Engendering PRSP 2

Khawar Mumtaz

Executive Summary

0.1. Introduction

Poor social indicators in Pakistan have prompted policy makers to take a closer look at the gender aspect of poverty reduction. Government of Pakistan's (GOP) Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) was launched in January 2002 with the objective of reducing poverty in the country. PRSP states that "poverty reduction efforts must address the gender dimension in order to deal with poverty meaningfully" and that "removal of the social and economic constraints that have hampered their access to and use of resources" is imperative.

0.2. The Gender Gap

The status of women in society is rooted in social structures that prevent the realization of their full potential and their due place in society. Lower position in society manifests in differentiated impacts on women in the field of education, health, labour force participation, political participation, access to assets and resources, etc. It is also the poorer households where the incidence of women's participation in the labour force is higher. The gap between males and females exists in all sectors (education, health, labour force participation, access to assets and resources, access to decision making) and is responsible for a lower GDI than HDI.

0.3. Major Barriers

The principle barrier in the way of gender equality is the societal perception of women as lower status dependents, reinforced both by customary practices and the laws of the land. Other obstacles include invisibility of women's work and inadequate recognition of their contribution. They lack information about opportunities, assets and services, do not own or control resources; are restricted in mobility, are equipped with non-marketable skills and have no voice. Violence and fear of violence are additional realities that constrain women.

0.4. Some Current Significant Interventions

PRSP, priority areas identified include gender responsive budgeting; leadership training of women councillors and members of provincial assemblies; micro-credit facilities for women, reinstatement of 5% quota for women in government jobs, among others. These have translated into several specific programmes linked to PRSP/MTDF/MDG targets.. Positively these also involve the finance and planning ministries and departments and have moved the programmes out of the sole domain of women's departments/ministry.

Implementation strategy includes building capacity of different government departments from the top to the local government level, as well as civil society organizations. Data generation for monitoring PRSP has also been initiated.

0.5. What More Needs to be Done

0.5.1. Coordination, Ownership and Administration:

The success of programmatic initiatives to a large extent depends upon the level of coordination between them to avoid duplication and unnecessary overlap and ownership down to the district level. There are bottlenecks in the administrative systems due to the lack of capacity to fully utilise allocated budgets.

0.5.2. Achieving PRSP Targets

Recent studies have highlighted that: there is a positive correlation between education, household well-being and employment opportunities in the formal sector; government is a “crucial driver” of change in; women’s public sector employment is an important legitimising factor of women’s improved status and mobility; and woman’s ownership and control of assets raises her status.

0.5.3. Monitoring Systems

The Gender Indicators in the PRSP document include: percentage of micro credit to women; percentage of zakat funds to women; number of women in civil service; ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years; share of women in wage employment in the non-agriculture sector; and proportion of seats held by women in Parliament: National Assembly, Senate. While adapting MDG indicators for Pakistan women’s land rights and tenure to land were dropped. The Gender Equality Matrix in the PRSP is not integrated into the monitoring of the ongoing PRS implementation. Missing are an indicator for the proportion by gender of those working as unpaid family workers, the non-inclusion of male comparators with female indicators in the Gender Equality Matrix and output indicators.

0.6. Recommendations

The above analysis leads to three sets of recommendations related to: a) coordination and administration; b) indicators; c) additional measures.

0.6.1. Coordination, administration and ownership

- Develop synergies between various initiatives under PRSP through simultaneous implementation and strong coordination.
- Build greater ownership at district/provincial levels by requiring provinces to set their 3-year aggregated targets and budget allocations reflected in annual development plans.

- Generation of disaggregated district level data (rural-urban; male-female).
- Poverty ranking by districts.
- Remove bottlenecks in departments and ministries to fully utilise allocated budgets.
- Ensure gender sensitivity among all tiers of public service personnel (*Gender mainstreaming in Planning & Development Division & Departments*), replicate the pilot *Gender Responsive Budget Initiative* in all provinces.

0.6.2. Indicators:

- Mainstream gender indicators with the main PRSP-2 targets and indicators.
- Include an indicator for the proportion by gender of those working as unpaid family workers.
- Include male comparators with female indicators.

Output indicators (to be further streamlined after PRSP-2 indicators are set)

- Number of National ID cards to women (rural and urban).
- Number of public sector employment opportunities for rural/urban poor women.
- Percentage of poor women in village/community level institutions (School Committees, water users associations, CCBs, etc.)
- Number of Emergency Obstetric Care centres established.

0.6.3. Additional measures:

- Micro level (village) women focused research and analysis.
- Ratification of ILO Convention 177 to ensure recognition and due remuneration of women's home-based work.
- Incentive schemes like to increase enrolment of girls at the middle and secondary levels.
- Creation of women owned/accessed assets and resources.

Reducing the Gender Gap/ Engendering PRSP 2

1. Introduction

Poor social indicators in Pakistan have prompted policy makers to take a closer look at the gender aspect of poverty reduction. Government of Pakistan's (GOP) Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) was launched in January 2002 with the objective of reducing poverty in the country. Its core elements were to engender growth, improve human development and governance and reduce the vulnerability of the poor to shocks. It recognizes that there poverty is not limited to income poverty alone and that it has both social and gender dimensions to it. PRSP states that "poverty reduction efforts must address the gender dimension in order to deal with poverty meaningfully" and that "removal of the social and economic constraints that have hampered their access to and use of resources" is imperative.

The Mid Term Development Framework 2005-2010, the operational plan for reducing poverty in Pakistan also acknowledges gender issues, emphasizing the integration of women across all sectors and promoting both: gender responsive budgeting approach in each line ministry and department, and making gender concerns a part of the macro economic framework. However the analysis in both the documents overlooks the significance of power structures in the creation and maintenance of social exclusion and poverty, and their role in impeding efforts to overcome it.

PRSP is aligned to the Millennium Development Goals that flowed from the Millennium Summit Declaration 2000 by heads of states to sustain development and eliminate poverty. MDGs were agreed upon by UN member states as a common framework of measuring progress in eradicating poverty. MTFD provides broad strategic directions for operationalising the PRSP set targets by 2015 (See Table 1 below). Centre for Research on Poverty Reduction and Income Distribution (CRPRID) in the Planning Commission is responsible for monitoring the progress towards achieving MDGS. In order to "reinforce convergence and linkages... to streamline monitoring and reporting, PRSP, MTFD and MDG targets have been aligned."¹ A combination of data sources (: PIHS, HIES, PLSMS, CWIQ, LFS, NNS, NEMIS, HMIS and reports of concerned ministries and the Planning Commission) are used for monitoring progress, underscoring the significance of strong data.²

¹ *Pakistan Millennium Development Goals Report 2005*. GOP, Planning Commission. 2005. p.2

² The MDGs have been criticized for ignoring the critical role of socio-political context at the root of poverty in achieving the targets and lacking in a focus on economic, political and social reforms while setting up goals and measurements; of failing to go beyond delivery systems to ensure access, utilization and equity by addressing social exclusion and gender bias. PRSP, too while recognizing social inequalities and concomitant unequal opportunities and capabilities is faulted for not addressing the skewed power structures that are at the core of Pakistan's deep rooted poverty.

Table 1: PRSP Alignment with Millennium Development Goals

Goals and Indicators	1990-91	2000-01	2005-06	2011	2015
1. Eradicate Poverty and Hunger					
• Overall Poverty level (% of Population)	26.1	32.10	29	22	16
• Poverty Gap Ratio		4.53	6.84		
2. Achieve Universal Primary Education					
• Literacy Rate of 15-24 years old (%)	49	58	59.5	78	86
• Gross Enrolment ³	73	87	104	104	100
3. Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women					
• Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years (%)	0.61	0.65	0.65		0.93
• Proportion of Seats held by women in the Parliament: National Assembly (%)	0.9	21			
Senate (%)	1.0	17			
Local Councils (%)		33			
4. Reduce Child Mortality					
• Infant Mortality Rate	120	77	63	50	40
• Proportion of fully immunized children 12-23 months	25%	53%	82%	90%	>90%
Under five mortality rate	140	105	80	65	52
5. Improve Maternal Health					
• Maternal Mortality Rate/100,000	550	450	350	180	140
• Total Fertility Rate	5.4%	4.1%	4.0%	2.5%	2.1%
LHW Coverage of target population	n/a	45%	77%	90%	100%
6. Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and other Diseases					
Incidence of TB/100,000	n/a	177	133		45
7. Ensure Environment Sustainability					
• Sustainable access to safe water	82%	86%	90%		93%
• Population with access to sanitation		28%	51%	55%	

Source: *Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead. PRSP 2003.* p. 92

The Ministry of Finance (MoF) is presently working on PRSP-2 and is faced with the challenge effective implementation within the time lines established in PRSP-1, sharpening the indicators to measure progress in implementation and if necessary review what needs to be included further to ensure the reduction in the gender gap in Pakistan. This paper after a brief review of the current situation of women in Pakistan tries to identify the major barriers to women's integration into the development process, makes recommendations to further consolidate PRSP-2, and for what more needs to be done towards achieving PRSP targets.

2. The Gender Gap

Recent studies have underscored the endemic nature of poverty in the country where class and caste, rural-urban, regional and provincial differentiation are the most important determinants of privilege and disadvantage.⁴ Similarly the status of women in society is rooted in social structures that prevent the realization of their full potential and their due place in society. There is generally no disagreement among planners and policy makers that women are more disadvantaged than men at the comparable social level.

Discrimination, gender inequality, and lack of access to inheritance, income and employment are some of the barriers in the way of women in moving out of poverty. Women find themselves excluded from social activities, services, public spaces and the labour market and hence experience poverty differently than men. Lower position in society manifests in differentiated impacts on women in the field of education, health, labour force participation, political participation, access to assets and resources, etc. It is also the poorer households where the incidence of women's participation in the labour force is higher. It is therefore not surprising that Pakistan's Gender Development Index (GDI) is poorer than its Human Development Index (HDI). The Gender Empowerment Measure (GEM) ranking at 71 out of 80 countries (UNHDR 2005) is better than other South Asian countries because of the reservation of women's seats in representative bodies from local government to parliament.

2.1. Education:

According to *Pakistan Social and Living Standards Measurement Survey (PSLMS) 2004-05* the total literacy rate for Pakistan (age 10 years and above) is 53 %. Of this literate males are 65% and females 40%, revealing a gender gap of 25%. In rural areas only 29% females are literate. While there has been a gradual increase in the net primary school (6-10 year olds) enrolment for both boys and girls, the enrolment remains skewed for the latter particularly in rural areas. One reason for the lower primary enrolment is identified as fewer schools for girls than boys.⁵ In 2004, out of the total number of primary schools in Pakistan 47.9% were found to be for boys, 28.3% for girls and 23.8% were mixed.⁶

⁴ Hussain, Akmal, *etal. HDR-Pakistan*. (2003). Gazdar, Haris. 2002

⁵ Mujahid-Mukhtar, Eshiya. "Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal: Education in Pakistan". Paper prepared for the UNDP Gender Responsive Budget Initiative Project. Islamabad. n.d.

⁶ *Ibid.* pp.11-12.

At the middle school level enrolment of all students (public and private schools) according to the *National Educational Management Information System 2003-04* (NEMIS) is 62% for boys and 38% for girls indicating a gender gap of 24%.⁷ Enrolment drops dramatically at the high school level for both girls and boys. Net enrolment for girls in rural areas is only 10%, almost half that of boys (18%).⁸

It is interesting to note that the two most significant reasons for never attending school for girls reported in Pakistan Integrated Household Survey (PIHS) 2001-2002 were: “parents didn’t allow” and “too expensive” (more so in urban than rural areas). “Too far” was the reason cited in rural areas (See Table 2 below). In other words more than one-third girls never attended school for social cultural reasons. Cost as a reason that applied to both boys and girls reflected poverty as a constraint to acquiring education. Interestingly for boys besides the issue of expenses, “child not willing” was a compelling reason to not attend school.

Table 2: Reason for never attending school (10-18 years) Overall Pakistan

Reasons	Percentage of cases where reason was cited – 2001-02 PIHS					
	Boys			Girls		
	Urban	Rural	Overall	Urban	Rural	Overall
Parents didn’t allow	1	3	3	36	36	36
Too expensive	53	36	40	33	25	26
Too far	2	10	8	3	15	14
Education not useful	1	1	1	1	1	1
Had to help at work	5	5	5	1	2	2
Had to help at home	1	2	2	3	5	5
Child not willing	22	30	29	11	6	7
Other	15	12	13	12	10	10

2.2 Health disparities:

The negative sex ratio is an indicator of gender disparities in health. Women’s health situation needs to be seen together with their reproductive health role. A high maternal mortality rate (350-450/100,000), as well as female mortality ratio of 1 to 4 year olds (which is 66 % higher for girls than boys) is indicative of the social factors that militate against women in the country. Twelve percent of Pakistan’s burden of disease is due to reproductive health problems and 6% to nutritional deficiencies. Pregnant women receive 87 % of the recommended calories and lactating women, 74%.

⁷ Mujahid-Mukhtar, opcit. p.14

⁸ PSLSMS 2004-05

2.3. Labour force participation:

The labour market in Pakistan is highly segmented on a gender basis with women's autonomous economic activity being an exception rather than the rule. Women's entry in the labour market is mediated by the family and/or by social networks and connections. A defining characteristic of women's employment is the gender based differential in remuneration with the wages of males being higher in both rural and urban areas.

The current female participation rate is 15.9% out of the total Labour Force Participation Rate (LFPR) of 43.7% (*LFS 2003-04*) with the rural rate at 19.5% and urban at 9.4%. The unemployment rate for women is two to five times higher than that of males in all age groups except the age bracket 10-24 years. Women's participation in the formal sector is under 10%. It is indeed paradoxical that despite factors (relative increases in the levels of education, later age of marriage at 22.7 years, and a decline in fertility) that have a positive correlation with female participation in the formal labour force women's LFPR is exceptionally low.

Women's presence in the informal sector is however higher with rural non-agricultural workers making up 70 % of the informal workforce and 61.6% in urban areas (*LFS 2003-04*). Women in this sector are usually atomized as home based piece-rate workers in both urban and rural areas, as contractual workers or in brick kilns and mines. Having no control over production processes women are vulnerable and dependent on those supplying them with work, often middlemen. Low levels of remuneration do not contribute to women's empowerment; in fact this kind of work is often the cause of additional burdening and oppression for them.

Women's informal sector work is closely associated with poverty, for instance in Pakistan 60% of home-based workers belong to households that are below the poverty line.⁹ The *Pakistan Participatory Poverty Assessment* (PPPA) also found that women's informal work was one of the most used risk mitigating strategies of poor households.¹⁰ However the level of female earnings remains low and usually supplements the income of the household. Only 7% women in a recent survey of the phenomenon reported their work as the main source of income for the household.¹¹

There was no official policy to regulate the informal sector up until 2002 when the new *Labour Policy* was put in place. Under the policy for the first time Home Based Women Workers (HBWW) were recognized and labour welfare coverage was extended to them.¹² However no action has been taken so far to implement the policy. *National Policy for Development and Empowerment of Women, 2002*, also calls for the recognition of women's "real economic contribution and productivity in both the formal and informal sectors ... in national economic indicators." (Article 5.4) Pakistan is not a signatory of

⁹ "The Status of Home-Based Women Workers in Informal Sector". NCSW Draft Report of Policy Research. 2004. p.27

¹⁰ PPA National Report.

¹¹ NCSW Draft Report, *Op cit.* p.46

¹² NCSW Draft Report. *Ibid.* p. 60

the ILO Convention No. 177 that accords recognition to home workers. Ratification of this convention would go a long way to ensure minimum standards for them.

2.4. Access to decision making:

Women, generally speaking in Pakistan, neither have a say in decision-making at the household and community level, nor on personal issues like marriage and divorce due to gender inequality. Socially disadvantaged women's participation in public activities and in representative bodies is even more difficult.

While political spaces for women have opened up with the Local Government Ordinance 2000 elite capture of these is also evident. A recent study in 7 villages across Pakistan reveals that the proportion of women voters was half that of men.¹³ It identifies social structural constraints (physical and social mobility) as curtailing factors in women's participation in politics. In two sites the distance to the polling booth was cited by women as the reason for not voting. The study also underscores the role of social structures whereby poorer households are less likely to vote than those belonging to the dominant caste/*biraderi* groups and women within them even less. Literacy was found to be positively correlated to women's voting with literate women more likely to vote but still 20% less than illiterate men. Under these circumstances chances of the voices of the poor to be heard, including those of women, in planning and development seem remote.

A companion study on livelihoods in the same sites found that in the village where women owned land there was a correlation between land ownership and demographic ratio and voting patterns. In the village in Chakwal district where about 4% women were landowners the male-female ratio was 104 women to 100 men. Here women were also more mobile. Elsewhere the ratio was worse for women.¹⁴

2.5. Access to assets and resources:

Women's access to assets is defined by the overall ownership and accessibility of resources of the poor. Land ownership, for instance, is highly unequal in Pakistan (less than half of rural households own any agricultural land). Poverty is high among the landless and highest among sharecroppers. Such a situation combined with social-cultural constraints doubly limits poor women's access and control over productive resources. Violence and fear of violence are additional realities that constrain women.

Zakat and *bait-ul-mal* an important precondition for mainstreaming gender issues are two potentially facilitative official mechanisms of financial support. Another is micro credit, provided both by government supported institutions and by NGOs.¹⁵ However none have managed to reach substantial number of those needing most support. A matter closely

¹³ Cheema, Ali. Draft paper for ADB. 2005.

¹⁴ Gazdar, Haris, Draft paper for ADB. 2005.

¹⁵ NGOs provided 1% of micro credit in urban areas and 0.8% in rural (NHDR/PIDE survey 2003); and less than 5% according to Heather Montgomery, *Meeting the Double Bottom Line – The Impact of Khushali Bank's Microfinance Programme in Pakistan*. (mimeo). ADB 2005.

related to access to *zakat*, bank loans or micro-credit is that of National Identity Cards (NIC) required by all official schemes. A large number of poor women particularly in rural areas do not own them. According to the 1998 census overall 74.41% of men and 53.41% women had received NICS (a gender gap of 21%). A recent study, *Transformative Social Protection*¹⁶ reveals the obstacles (e.g. no birth certificates, no school certificates, no *nikah namas*) in the way of getting ID cards especially in rural areas. Where women manage to access micro-credit they do not always have control over it. However, even if the poorest have not been reached, organisations providing micro-credit have been pioneers in this field in Pakistan. Having garnered valuable experience their challenge is of refocusing their programmes to reach the poorest.

3. Major Barriers

To sum up, the principle barrier in overcoming gender inequality is societal perception of women as lower status dependents. A fact reinforced both by customary practices and the laws of the land. Other obstacles include invisibility of women's work and inadequate recognition of their contribution within the household and by extension in society. As a result women's work is menial and low paid, even when time and energy consuming, contributing relatively minimally towards poverty eradication. Women remain uninformed about opportunities, assets and services, and they have neither ownership nor control over resources. Moreover, women's mobility is restricted, skills not always marketable and voice not heard. In other words women are largely disempowered. The major challenge is to create acceptance of a more public and active role for them that opens the pathways of empowerment for them.

4. Some Current Significant Interventions

Cognizance of the disempowered nature of women's situation has led to several initiatives by the government over the last two decades, but without meaningful impact as is evident from available indicators, pointing towards the need for more intensive and focused interventions. The PRSP reiterates GOP's commitment made at the Beijing Conference to mainstream gender as a policy. It also recognises the shift from the earlier social welfare approaches and the need to empower women for equitable access through removing social and economic constraints.¹⁷ PRSP-identified priority areas for addressing gender inequality include: gender responsive budgeting (GRB) to analyse budgets at different administrative levels for allocation of resources; leadership training of women councilors and members of provincial assemblies; micro-credit facilities for women through Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund (PPAF), First Women Bank (FWB), Agricultural Development Bank (ADB) and Khushali Bank; reinstatement of 5% quota for women in government jobs, among others.¹⁸

¹⁶ Naila Kabir, Khawar Mumtaz, Asad Sayeed. (2005) being finalized.

¹⁷ *Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper*. GOP.2003. p. 93

¹⁸ *Ibid.* p. 96

These have translated into programmes, carrying over in a few instances from earlier initiatives. While some are already operational others are in process. Supported by multi- and bi- lateral donors these include:

- A 5-year UNDP supported Gender Support Programme. Its three pillars are Enhancing Political Participation; Promoting Economic Opportunities; and Facilitating Institutional Reform. The interventions under these are: *Women's Political School* project; *Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative* being piloted in two districts of Punjab; *Gender Mainstreaming in Planning & Development Departments and Division*; *Institutional Strengthening of the NCSW*; *Gender Justice through Musalihat Anjuman*; and *Women's Access to Capital and Technology*.
- A 4-year ADB funded Gender Reform Action Programme (GRAP) with MOWD, at the federal and provincial levels for reforms in: budgeting and public expenditure mechanisms; to increase and improve women employment in the public sector; and to improve women's political participation.
- Among other initiatives are the National Programme for Women's Political Participation (2002-2006), Department for International Development (DfID) supported Gender Equality Project, Canadian International Development Agency's (CIDA) Programme for the Advancement of Gender Equality, Health and Education Sector Reforms, incentive schemes for enrollment of girls in schools, and many others being carried out with the collaboration of NGOs not listed here.

A positive feature of the programmes is that these also involve the finance and planning ministries and departments. Thus the Finance Ministry, the Planning and Development Department, Ministry of Local Government, Economic Affairs Division, and the Federal Bureau of Statistics are now more actively engaged reflecting the acceptance both at the federal and provincial levels of the need for addressing gender equality issues. Moving the programmes out of the sole domain of women's departments/ministry is a pre-requisite for mainstreaming gender issues. Equally, building upon the relative strengths of different government departments from the top tiers to that of the local government level, as well as civil society organizations is an important strategy for successful interventions.

Similarly, measures to generate relevant data for PRSP/MTDF/MDG monitoring down to the district level and building capacity of data generating institutions has also been initiated.

5. What More Needs to be Done

5.1. Coordination, Ownership and Administration:

Notwithstanding the fact that some of the initiatives complement each other, especially those under the Gender Support Programme, their success to a large extent depends upon

the level of coordination between them to avoid duplication and unnecessary overlap. A feature of Pakistan's development experience is of well designed programmes faltering in implementation; and of well intentioned policies not benefiting the neediest (the experience of social safety nets, micro-credit programmes, etc. demonstrates that). To overcome this gap between policies, targets and implementation a major effort is required to create ownership of programmes and projects (the Tawana project is a glaring example of lack of ownership). Following the restructuring of the governance structure through the Devolution Programme the ownership has to be at the provincial as well as district levels.

As a first step towards ownership and integration of federally developed strategies in provincial and district governments would be setting targets according to their priorities with reference to the overall PRSP and MTFDF ones, and reflect them in the annual development plans. These will require disaggregated district level data best generated by the provincial bureaus of statistics following requisite capacity building. Poverty ranking of districts according to criteria that can be developed on the basis of a countrywide or province-wide prior ranking can help to determine appropriate interventions.¹⁹ This would also create greater ownership of interventions by district/provincial departments and agencies.

Yet another feature to be noted is that of the lack of capacity to fully utilise the allocated budgets suggesting bottlenecks in the administrative systems. Under the Population Welfare Ministry's budget for 2004-05, for instance, the absorptive capacity of service delivery components was relatively low. The budgetary expenditure on Mobile Service Units was just 48% and that of Village Based Male Mobilisers even lower at 38%.²⁰ Whether these were the result of infrastructural shortcomings, logistical reasons, or both is unclear. The fact that quarterly fund transfer from the Federal Government to the Provincial Population Welfare Departments takes on average almost three months, with another month or so for provincial processing and disbursement, must affect the performance of the programme. In Punjab province the release of funds took up to 54 days in the last four quarters.²¹

At the same time the budget making process will need a serious revisit. In this connection the Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative put in place as part of PRSP strategy to address the gender gap in planning and budget formulation seems to be validating its significance. For instance, *Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal: Education in Pakistan* under the initiative has revealed that education budgets are "basically gender blind and have not been designed on the basis of gender needs." The budget as formulated allocates most of the funds for running existing system, thus since there are more boys' schools they receive more funds under the recurrent budget. Similarly, as the current emphasis is on girls' access to education those already enrolled do not benefit from this. In the same way, making allocations on the basis of current gender enrolment means the maintenance of the status quo. Mujahid-Mukhtar sees additional funds per capita for girls' schemes as

¹⁹ See Gazdar for a discussion on this.

²⁰ Rukanuddin, Abdul Razzaq, and Inam-ul-Haq. *Gender-Aware Policy Appraisal for Population Sector*. (mimeo) Islamabad. 2005 p. 24

²¹ *Ibid.* p. 28

the only means of narrowing the gap. She further recommends focusing on both supply and demand side of the barriers to female education for “improving gender outcomes.”²² It is evident that building gender sensitivity among financial planners is imperative and needs to be replicated in all provinces.

5.2. Achieving PRSP Targets

The recent thematic studies based on in-depth analyses of 7 villages for ADB’s *Drivers of Change* research project reaffirm that there is a positive correlation between education and household well-being as well as employment opportunities in the formal sector. Secondly, that government is a “crucial driver wherever change was observed” indicating the primary role of policy and government action in addressing poverty. Thirdly, women’s public sector employment is an important legitimising factor of women’s improved status and mobility, and finally that woman’s ownership and control of assets raises her status.

In other words the responsibility for effecting change has to be led by government in a longer term perspective as short term programmatic interventions have not demonstrated the capacity for structural transformation. While education is a national priority here too government carries the principle burden especially given that 86.4% schools are in the public sector and only 11.4% in the private. Given that Pakistan is lagging behind in meeting PRSP and MDG targets some measures, other than the already defined micro-credit, education and health sector initiatives, would facilitate and speed up progress.

5.3. Monitoring Systems

Goals and targets under MDGs are measurable and time bound as are those adapted for Pakistan. Interestingly one of the MDG indicators is women’s land tenure, however in adaptation that has been dropped in Pakistan despite the fact that lack of ownership of assets has been identified through a number of studies as a significant cause of women’s lack of empowerment.

In order to keep track of policies and programmes appropriate monitoring mechanisms are necessary and are an integral part of the PRSP. The Gender Indicators in the PRSP document include:

- Percentage of micro credit to women
- Percentage of zakat funds to women
- Number of women in civil service
- Ratio of literate females to males of 15-24 years
- Share of women in wage employment in the non-agriculture sector

²² Mujahid-Mukhtar, Eshya. pp. 4-5

- Proportion of seats held by women in Parliament: National Assembly, Senate

In addition, Chapter 6 of PRSP (“Addressing IPRSP Gaps”) includes a Gender Equality Matrix with key instruments and indicators for reducing gender disparity. The rationale for separate indicators is unclear especially since these have not been integrated in the monitoring of the ongoing PRS implementation. An excellent recent assessment of PRSP’s monitoring indicators for gender, points to the absence of an indicator for the proportion by gender of those working as unpaid family workers and to the non-inclusion of male comparators with female indicators.²³ Both are points that need to be noted when finalizing PRSP-2. The assessment that also comments on the indicators in the Gender Equality Matrix provides guidelines for indicators that need to be retained or dropped to enable meaningful monitoring. One recommendation is for the development of output indicators to complement the outcome indicators currently part of PRSP-1 and finally for mainstreaming gender indicators with the main PRSP-2 targets and indicators.

Once the main targets and indicators of PRSP-2 are available the gender equality indicators can be developed according to the above guidelines.

6. Recommendations

The above analysis leads to three sets of recommendations related to: a) coordination and administration; b) indicators; c) additional measures.

6.1. Coordination, administration and ownership

- Develop synergies between various initiatives under PRSP through simultaneous implementation and strong coordination for greater impact and avoidance of duplication and unnecessary overlap.
- Build greater ownership by district/provincial departments and agencies of strategies, policies and interventions through requiring provinces to set their 3-year aggregated targets and budget allocations that are reflected in annual development plans.
- Build capacity of provincial bureaus of statistics to generate disaggregated district level data (rural-urban; male-female).
- Rank districts by poverty on the basis of a countrywide or province-wide prior ranking to determine appropriate interventions.²⁴
- Introduce systems in departments and ministries for smooth transfer of funds to fully utilise allocated budgets.

²³ Debbie Budlender, *Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: Monitoring indicators for gender*”.

²⁴ As suggested by Gazdar, *Opcit*.

- Ensure gender sensitivity among all tiers of public service personnel (as envisaged under the *Gender mainstreaming in Planning & Development Division & Departments*), financial planners and gender sensitive budgets by replicating the pilot *Gender Responsive Budget Initiative* in all provinces.

6.2. Indicators:

- The overarching recommendation is for mainstreaming gender indicators with the main PRSP-2 targets and indicators.
- Include an indicator for the proportion by gender of those working as unpaid family workers.
- Include male comparators with female indicators.

Some preliminary suggestions for output indicators, that will need to be further streamlined and aligned to the indicators developed for PRSP-2 are as under:

- Number of National ID cards to women (rural and urban) to facilitate access to resources (credit, *zakat*, bank accounts), formal employment, and political participation (which with Devolution has become reachable at the grassroots level).
- Number of public sector employment opportunities for women in rural and urban areas (LHWs, LHVs, school teachers, others).²⁵
- Percentage of poor women in village/community level institutions under government development programmes and projects e.g. School Committees that function in many rural areas,²⁶ water users associations, CCBs, etc.
- Number of Emergency Obstetric Care centres established as a critical measure towards reducing high maternal mortality.

6.3. Additional measures:

- Micro level (village) research and analysis to provide insights and local diversities for more focused women centred poverty eradication strategies, e.g. gender based intra household distribution of food and resources; transformative aspects of women's political participation and barriers; the incidence of female headed households and their problems; etc.
- Ratification of ILO Convention 177 to ensure the recognition of women's home-based non-formal work and due remuneration.

²⁵ Gazdar, *Ibid.*

²⁶ Cheema, *opcit.*

- Incentive schemes like the Tawana programme (and its resumption) to increase the enrolment of girls at the middle and secondary levels.
- Creation of women owned/accessed assets and resources by inducting the land tenure indicator of MDGs. Or as short term measure to give joint deeds in the name of male and female heads of household under official land to the less schemes.²⁷ Provision of jointly owned homestead land to the landless.

²⁷ The recent earthquake has demonstrated the negative effect of male ownership alone. Deaths of males have deprived females of their rightful share and security.

ANNEX-1

Table. 3. Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)²⁸	
MDGs and Targets	Indicators for Pakistan
Goal 1: Eradicate Extreme Poverty and Hunger	
Target 1: Halve, between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people whose income is less than one dollar a day	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of population below the calorie based food plus non-food national poverty line
Target 2: Halve between 1990 and 2015, the proportion of people who suffer from hunger	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Prevalence of underweight children (under-five years of age) • Proportion of population below minimum level of dietary energy consumption
Goal 2: Achieve Universal Primary Education	
Target 3: Ensure that, by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Net primary enrolment ratio • Completion/survival rate to grade 5. • Literacy rate
Goal 3: Promote Gender Equality and Empower Women	
Target 4: Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and to all levels of education no later than 2015.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gender Parity Index (GPI) for primary, secondary and tertiary education. • Youth literacy GPI • Share of women in wage employment in the non-agricultural sector. • Proportion of seats held by women in National Assembly and Senate, provincial assemblies and local councils
Goal 4: Reduce Child Mortality	
Target 5: Reduce by two-thirds, between 1990 and 2015, the under-five mortality rate	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Under-five mortality rate. • Infant mortality rate. • Proportion of fully immunized children aged 12-23 months against measles • Proportion of children under five who suffered from diarrhea in the last 30 days • Lady Health Workers' coverage of target population
Goal 5: Improve Maternal Health	
Target 6: Reduce by three-quarters, between 1990 and 2015, the maternal mortality ratio	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maternal mortality ratio. • Proportion of births attended by skilled health personnel. • Contraceptive prevalence rate • Total fertility rate • Proportion of women 15-49 years who had given birth during last 3 years, and made at least one antenatal care consultation
Goal 6: Combat HIV/AIDS, Malaria and Other Diseases	

²⁸ Pakistan Millennium Development Goals Report 2005.

<p>Target 7:Have halted by 2015, and begun to reverse, the spread of HIV/AIDS.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • HIV prevalence among 15-24 year old pregnant women. • HIV prevalence among vulnerable groups (e.g. active sex workers)
<p>Target 8:Have halted by 2015, and begun to reverse, the incidence of malaria and other major diseases.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of population in malaria risk areas using effective malaria prevention and treatment measures. • Incidence of tuberculosis per 100,000 • Proportion of TB cases detected and cured under DOTS (Directly Observed Treatment Short Course).
<p>Goal 7: Ensure Environmental Sustainability</p>	
<p>Target 9:Integrate the principles of sustainable development into country policies and programs and reverse the loss of environmental resources.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forest cover including state-owned and private forest and farmlands • Land area protected for the conservation of wildlife • GDP per unit of energy use (as proxy for energy efficiency) • No. of vehicles using CNG fuel • Sulphur content in high speed diesel (as a proxy for ambient air quality)
<p>Target 10:Halve, by 2015, the proportion of people without sustainable access to safe drinking water</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of population with sustainable access to an improved water source, urban and rural • Proportion of urban and rural population with access to improved sanitation
<p>Target 11:By 2020, to have achieved a significant improvement in the lives of at least 100 million slum dwellers</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of katchi abadis (slums) regularized.
<p>Goal 8: Develop a Global Partnership for Development</p>	
<p>Target 12:Develop further an open, rule-based, predictable, non-discriminatory trading and financial system. Includes a commitment to good governance, development, and poverty reduction-both nationally and internationally.</p> <p>Target 15:Deal comprehensively with the debt problems of developing countries through national and international measures in order to make debt sustainable in the long term.</p> <p>Target 16:In co-operation with developing countries, develop and implement strategies for decent and productive work for youth.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Market Access • Debt Sustainability • ODA Assistance • Unemployment rate of young people aged 15-24 years each sex and total
<p>Target 17: In-co-operation with pharmaceutical companies, provide access to affordable, essential drugs in developing countries.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proportion of population with access to affordable essential drugs on a sustainable basis

Target 18: In co-operation with the private sector, make available the benefits of new technologies, especially information and communications.

- Telephone lines and cellular subscribers per 100 populations.
- Personal computers in use per 100 population and internet users per 100 population